



The 8th Annual Conference of AAHANZBS

Academic Association of Historians in Australian and New Zealand Business Schools

Alternative Business Histories

3–4 November 2016, Dunmore Lang College, Macquarie University, Sydney Australia

Hosted by the Department of Marketing and Management,
Macquarie University

Co-sponsored by the Business and Labour History Group,
The University of Sydney

Conference Program and Abstracts

Day 1

Thursday 3 November 2016

9:15 – 9:45	Registration	
9:45 - 10:00	Welcome	Nikki Balnave (Macquarie University and President of AAHANZBS)
10:00-11:00	Plenary - Constructing the Calculable Patient: The Hybridisation of Accounting and Medical Knowledge in the Psychiatric Asylum. A Personal Story of Transdisciplinary Research into Management History	Cheryl McWatters (University of Ottawa)
11:00 – 11:30	Morning tea	
11:30 – 12:00	Where is the historical employment relations research in hospitality and tourism?	David Williamson, Erling Rasmussen, Candice Harris & Katherine Ravenswood (Auckland University of Technology)
12:00-12:30	Tales of redundancy and life thereafter: A study of former SECV employees living in the Latrobe Valley, Victoria	Mathin Biswas, Marjorie Jerrard & Julian Teicher (Monash University)
12:30-1:00	History Repeats? Changes in the Role of Frontline Managers over Time	Greg Patmore (The University of Sydney), Ray Markey (Macquarie University) & Keith Townsend (Griffith University)
1:00 – 2:00	Lunch	
2:00-2:30	Formal and informal business knowledge transfer across markets: Developing Australian discount department stores	Matthew Bailey (Macquarie University)
2:30-3:00	Re-reading the Office: Workplace Spaces as Historical Documents	Robert Crawford (University of Technology Sydney)
3:00-3:30	Vale Jim Staples: A Great Humanitarian and Social Justice Advocate	Julie Zetler (Macquarie University)
3:30-4:00	Afternoon tea	
4:00-4:30	Not Just Pin Money: Businesswomen in Colonial Cities	Catherine Bishop (Australian Catholic University)
4:30-5:00	Annual General Meeting	
6:00 – 6:30	Pre-dinner drinks	Sponsored by the Department of Modern History, Politics & International Relations, MQU
6:30 - 9:00	Dinner at Lachlan's	Sponsored by the Department of Marketing & Management, MQU

Day 2
Friday 4 November 2016
Symposium on Co-operatives, Mutuals and Labour

9:15-9:45	Registration	
9:45-10:00	Introduction to the Symposium	Greg Patmore and Mark Westcott (The University of Sydney)
10:00-10:30	The Labour Movement and Co-operatives	Nikki Balnave (Macquarie University) and Greg Patmore (The University of Sydney)
10:30-11:00	Morning Tea	
11:00-11:30	Mutualism and Labourism: Westfund	Harry Knowles, Greg Patmore and Mark Westcott (The University of Sydney)
11:30-12:00	Industry superannuation funds: a new kind of mutual	Aaron Paul, Bernard Mees and Cathy Brigden (RMIT)
12:00-12:30	Union Mutuality Beyond the 'Mutual': The collective development of a N.Z. Single Industry Town Hospital	Fiona Hurd (Auckland University of Technology)
12:30-1:30	Lunch	
1:30-2:00	Andrew Spink: Self-Help and Mutual Societies in Early Twentieth Century Brisbane	Christina Ealing-Godbold (State Library of Queensland)
2:00-2:30	The Rise and Fall of Union Cooperative Power in Chhattisgarh	Timothy Kerswell (University of Macau)
2:30-3:00	Afternoon Tea	
3:00-4:00	Round Table on Teaching: Beyond the Capitalist Firm.	Facilitator – Nikki Balnave (Macquarie University)
4:00	Conference close	

Abstracts

Day 1 – Thursday 3 November 2016

Plenary

Cheryl S. McWatters (Father Edgar Thivierge Chair of Business History, University of Ottawa)

Constructing the Calculable Patient: The Hybridisation of Accounting and Medical Knowledge in the Psychiatric Asylum. A Personal Story of Transdisciplinary Research into Management History

In recent years, researchers, research funders and university administrators have encouraged (and in some cases, increasingly demanded) that research be of an 'interdisciplinary/multidisciplinary/transdisciplinary nature. Nonetheless, when such research is undertaken and often when proposed for funding, its evaluation falls back into narrow disciplinary boundaries. Experience has reinforced that while such research is encouraged; it is less often funded and frequently challenged in terms of its knowledge creation and contributions.

In this presentation, I first outline efforts to undertake research of a transdisciplinary nature, specifically the hybridisation of accounting and nursing with respect to the management of the psychiatric hospital. After setting the stage, I present our research story, its upside and downside, positives and pitfalls. Finally, I offer a demonstration of this work through one of our projects in terms of the construction of the calculable patient.

In this study, we highlight how medical and nursing knowledge along with knowledge from accounting merged not only to scientifically manage the psychiatric hospital but also to govern the population at large. This kind of hybridised knowledge emerged out of the perceived necessity that in order to prevent the occurrence of psychiatric illnesses and to manage them effectively, two things were necessary: (1) reliable data about the distribution of mental illnesses in the population; and (2) systematic implementation of accounting in psychiatry to increase the efficacy of asylums.

Medical interest in normalisation and standardisation met the interest in accounting to develop calculable spaces. These interests, in turn, met the governmental interest in gaining increased (statistical) knowledge about the health (i.e., mental health) condition of the population. Accounting enabled, on the one hand, to create the hospital as a calculable 'physical' space and, on the other hand, to create the population as a kind of 'theoretical space' because this technology enabled the relation of different statistical variables in order to make a population 'calculable'.

The crucial instrument to connect the macro level of the population and the micro level of the everyday interactions in the asylum, in order to create these calculable spaces, was the medical record and the documentation collected in the record. Since the beginning of the twentieth century, documentation and medical records became increasingly standardised, leading to what could be called the calculable patient. Notes and all kind of documentation had to be collected in such a way that they complied with pre-defined statistical categories and could be used for statistical surveys (i.e., census data). Using case examples from the fever ward of the Toronto Hospital, we demonstrate how the calculable patient and his or her identity emerged in the record. Our studies contribute generally

to our understanding of hybridity and hybridised knowledge, and specifically, of how accounting and management were diffused within medical knowledge. As such, it illustrates, in visible terms, Hopwood's concept of 'accounting in everyday life', in this case in the context of the hospital. We believe that our work confirms the need for research that is transdisciplinary in nature as a vehicle to tease out and confront these calculable spaces.

David Williamson, Erling Rasmussen, Candice Harris and Katherine Ravenswood (Auckland University of Technology)

Where is the historical employment relations research in hospitality and tourism?

This paper questions the lack of historical employment relations research in the hospitality and tourism sectors. Based on recent doctoral research into the New Zealand hotels, the paper presents theoretical approaches that could bring a more critical, historical and insightful focus to employment in these industries.

Recent Government reports in Australia and New Zealand have highlighted escalating problems in the hospitality and Tourism labour markets (Deloitte, 2015; New Zealand Tourism Industry Association, 2015). The reports contrast the rapid growth and economic success of the sectors (both being one of the largest export earning sectors for their countries) with long standing, yet steadily worsening labour market problems. These problems include major skills shortages, high labour turnover, low pay, lack of full-time work and poor career path information (Cropp, 2016; Deloitte, 2015; New Zealand Tourism Industry Association, 2015). This contemporary data highlights the intensification of long-identified problems around human resource management, employment relations and labour markets in the international hospitality and tourism literature (Baum, 2007, 2008; Deery, 2002; Enz, 2009; Lucas, 2004).

Despite its crucial economic importance and the fact that the hospitality and tourism sector is demonstrating all the symptoms of a labour market in dire crisis, historical employment relations research in this field of remains scant. There is copious international research on the problematic nature of work in international hospitality and tourism, highlighting the well-trodden themes of high labour turnover, poor career progression, low pay, poor work conditions, poor work-life balance and weak occupation and safety systems (Ancheri & Kandasamy, 2009; Baum, 2007, 2008; Chen, Cheung, & Law, 2012; Davidson, McPhail, & Barry, 2011; Deery, 2002; Enz, 2009; Harkison, Poulston, & Jung-Hee, 2011; McGing & Connolly, 2007; Mooney, 2007; Mooney & Ryan, 2009; Poulston, 2008; Richardson, 2009; Wickramasekara, 2011; Williamson, 2009; Williamson, Harris, & Parker, 2008; Wong & Ko, 2009; Wood, 1997). However, little of the above research focusses on the historical development of power relations between the tri-partite stakeholders in the employment relationship.

The paper will argue that despite calls to liberate hospitality and tourism research from 'presentist', positivist, unitarist paradigms (Lashley, 2007; Lashley, Lynch, & Morrison, 2006; Lashley & Morrison, 2000; Lynch, Molz, Mcintosh, Lugosi, & Lashley, 2011; O'Gorman, 2005; Walton, 2012; Zampoukos & Ioannides, 2011), there remains little in the way of contemporary critical, historical employment relations research in the field. Based in recently completed research in the New Zealand hotel industry, the paper will call for a re-engagement with multi-level, historical employment relations analysis of hospitality and tourism. The paper concludes by highlighting a number of valuable areas of research that resulted from the application of a historical employment relations approach, including

a re-analysis of the role of unions in hospitality and tourism and the historical origins of managerial attitudes towards collective bargaining.

References

- Ancheri, S., & Kandasamy, I. (2009). Hotel employees' expectations of QWL: A qualitative study. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 28(3), 328–337. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2008.11.003>
- Baum, T. (2007). Human resources in tourism: Still waiting for change. *Tourism Management*, 28(6), 1383–1399. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2007.04.005>
- Baum, T. (2008). Implications of hospitality and tourism labour markets for talent management strategies. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 20(7), 720–729. <http://doi.org/10.1108/09596110810897574>
- Chen, R., Cheung, C., & Law, R. (2012). A review of the literature on culture in hotel management research: What is the future? *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 31(1), 52–65. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2011.06.010>
- Cropp, A. (2016, January 31). Hotel staff shortages spell trouble for tourism. *Sunday Star Times*. Auckland N.Z.
- Davidson, M. C. G., McPhail, R., & Barry, S. (2011). Hospitality HRM: Past, present and the future. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 23(4), 498–516. <http://doi.org/10.1108/09596111111130001>
- Deery, M. (2002). Labour turnover in international hospitality and tourism. In *Human resource management: international perspectives in hospitality and tourism*. London: Continuum.
- Deloitte. (2015). *Australian Tourism Labour Force Report: 2015-2020*. Australian Trade Commission.
- Enz, C. A. (2009). Human resource management: A troubling issue for the global hotel industry. *Cornell Hospitality Quarterly*, 50(4), 578–583. <http://doi.org/10.1177/1938965509349030>
- Harkison, T., Poulston, J., & Jung-Hee, G. K. (2011). Hospitality graduates and managers: The big divide. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 23(3), 377–392. <http://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/09596111111122541>
- Lashley, C. (2007). Discovering hospitality: Observations from recent research. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 1(3), 214–226. <http://doi.org/10.1108/17506180710817747>
- Lashley, C., Lynch, P., & Morrison, A. J. (2006). *Hospitality: A social lens*. Amsterdam ; Boston, MA: Elsevier.
- Lashley, C., & Morrison, A. J. (2000). *In search of hospitality: Theoretical perspectives and debates*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Lucas, R. E. (2004). *Employment relations in the hospitality and tourism industries*. London: Routledge.
- Lynch, P., Molz, J. G., Mcintosh, A., Lugosi, P., & Lashley, C. (2011). Theorizing hospitality. *Hospitality & Society*, 1(1), 3–24. http://doi.org/10.1386/hosp.1.1.3_2

- McGing, G., & Connolly, P. (2007). High performance work practices and competitive advantage in the Irish hospitality sector. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 19(3), 201–210. <http://doi.org/10.1108/09596110710739903>
- Mooney, S. (2007, October 2). *Where is she? A female manager's place in Australian and New Zealand hotels* (Thesis). AUT University. Retrieved from <http://aut.researchgateway.ac.nz/handle/10292/216>
- Mooney, S., & Ryan, I. (2009). A woman's place in hotel management: upstairs or downstairs? *Gender in Management*, 24(3), 195–210. <http://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/17542410910950877>
- New Zealand Tourism Industry Association. (2015). *People & Skills 2025*.
- O'Gorman, K. (2005). Modern hospitality: Lessons from the past. *The Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 12(2), 141–151.
- Poulston, J. (2008). Hospitality workplace problems and poor training: a close relationship. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 20(4), 412–427. <http://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/09596110810873525>
- Richardson, S. (2009). Undergraduates' perception of tourism and hospitality as a career choice. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 28, 382–388.
- Shonfield, A. (1965). *Modern Capitalism: the changing balance of public and private power*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Walton, J. K. (2012). "The tourism labour conundrum" extended: Historical perspectives on hospitality workers. *Hospitality & Society*, 2(1), 49–75. http://doi.org/10.1386/hosp.2.1.49_1
- Wickramasekara, P. (2011). International Migration Programme. Retrieved from http://works.bepress.com/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1003&context=piyasiri_wickramasekara
- Williamson, D. (2009). *That's no way to say goodbye: Exit interviews and employee turnover in New Zealand hotels*. AUT University, Auckland, New Zealand. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/10292/765>
- Williamson, Harris, C., & Parker, J. (2008). I love you-goodbye: Exit interviews and turnover in the New Zealand hotel industry. *New Zealand Journal of Employment Relations*, 33(3), 70–90.
- Wong, S. C., & Ko, A. (2009). Exploratory study of understanding hotel employees' perception on work-life balance issues. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 28(2), 195–203. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2008.07.001>
- Wood, R. C. (1997). *Working in hotels and catering* (2nd ed). London: International Thomson Business Press.
- Zampoukos, K., & Ioannides, D. (2011). The tourism labour conundrum: Agenda for new research in the geography of hospitality workers. *Hospitality & Society*, 1(1), 25–45. http://doi.org/10.1386/hosp.1.1.25_1
-

Mathin Biswas, (Monash University), **Marjorie Jerrard** (Monash University) and **Julian Teicher** (CQ University)

Tales of redundancy and life thereafter: A study of former SECV employees living in the Latrobe Valley, Victoria

This study of the experiences of twenty State Electricity Commission of Victoria (SECV) managers and workers of tales of redundancy and life thereafter demonstrates the importance of their professional or work identity with the SECV, even after several years away from the organisation. As social relations at work form part of a person's work identity it raises the question of whether work identity is also constructed in a place and shaped by the labour history, labour geography and industrial relations of this location, as indicated by Ellem (2015) and Ellem and McGrath-Champ (2012). Herod (2012) specifically argued that workers either consciously or unconsciously act as geographical actors and it would appear that this applies equally well to managers and professionals. Identity was also tied to the geographic location of the SECV and the other people who lived in the Latrobe Valley. In our study, an engineer, Participant Sharer, stated:

That was a good time. Of course I had friends I developed to visit [in Yallourn], to earbash them.... So I feel I belong to the Valley. I'm always extolling its virtues, an hour from the snow, an hour from the beach. Never go to either, but the point is we could.

Other sources of identity were the 'artefacts' used while working – for example, equipment such as dredges – and the location of the work – for example, the main administrative building, the mine, the power station. Therefore, workers and managers in a region such as the Latrobe Valley, Victoria, construct their work identity based on local history, local industrial relations, with the latter being derived from organisational structure and trade union structure, work artefacts and work location.

The hierarchical structure of jobs within an organisation influences this work identity, particularly if carried outside of the organisation into the community. The SECV had a command and control approach to managing the workforce combined with a tradition of paternalistic benevolence that was also reflected in the company garden township of Yallourn where a person's job classification determined the type of housing available to them and their family. According to a school teacher, Betty, even the school room had an hierarchy drawn from the SECV structure with the children of managers at the top, then engineers, and so on across all trades and job categories. The trade unions covering the SECV workforce also had a hierarchy of importance with those covering 'engineers' at the top. When the Yallourn township was demolished:

It was painful. Very painful. Particularly to people who were living there... A lot of them took their own houses. A lot of houses were put on the back of a truck Then when it eventually went, you felt like part of your life disappeared.

Ironically, the houses moved were those of the workers at the lower end of the hierarchy because they could be cut in half as they were weatherboard, not brick.

Work identity of managers and workers was elicited from the participants through the use of semi-structured interviews combined with a photo book. While the interviews were a traditional data collection method in labour history, the application of photo-elicitation as a complementary tool was novel. This approach involved the lead researcher visiting specific sites with the first participant, Peter, and taking photographs. The site visits and photographs were important for the researcher's

understanding of the extent and nature of the various SECV operations – mining of brown coal, power generation, briquette manufacturing, and remnants of the company and garden town of Yallourn. The researcher then compiled the site photographs into a photo book. This book was taken to all subsequent interviews. The precise nature of its use depended upon the participant; for example, if a participant stated that he (the participants who volunteered for this stage of the project as former workers and managers were all male) had been employed in a technical occupation, the photographs that were initially shown to him were of equipment which he may have used and sites at which he may have worked. If he was a manager, the photographs would be of the building or site at which he managed.

The photographs were used as an aide-mémoire to stimulate recall in terms of events and the surrounding detail but also the feelings and emotions associated with those events. In essence, photographs were found to generate greater nostalgic detail than can be elicited from conversation arising from interviews. When shown a photograph of a large white abandoned building, Participant Peter explained how he had his office in the building when he worked for the SECV: “I’d go to meetings and all sorts of things, we did a lot of things from that building. But that building was sold, I don’t know how come it’s been fenced off and empty.” For Participant Perry, the building reminded him of his father’s job as an accountant working in the main office building. Perry visited his father’s workplace as child and then followed his father into the SECV but as an engineer, thus demonstrating the intergenerational nature of the SECV workforce. Perry also commented on how beautiful the white building was. Now it stands behind a fence carrying warning and keep out signage. As a participant who was an elected trade union official said “... that’s rehabilitation. You just leave places like this and put a fence around them. It’s wonderful isn’t it?” This fence and fences in a number of other photographs served as a metaphor of separation between the participants’ work identity at the time of their SECV employment, a time that was seen as positive because the work identity was derived from a vibrant working community, and the post-SECV employment, a time not regarded so favourably.

Participant Councillor commented on how the photograph of the administrative building reminded him of “all the workers streaming out of there” at the end of a shift while Participant Sharer commented on the role of the SECV as a major training provider:

There’s greatly reduced opportunities for young people to be trained in trades and the like, which is very sad. I think at any one [time] there was something like 1000 people as apprentices and trainees of all sorts here. Of course, that just stopped. In privatisation the companies prefer to pinch people off each other.

For the participants, their employment with the SECV and their attachment to the Valley were dominant themes which came out through the interviews. Work identities of the participants have been constructed in relation to their workplaces – administrative building, power station, mine, briquette factory – the history of the organisation and industrial relations, and the history of the Valley. The photographs of buildings and objects behind fences came to symbolise a glorious past no longer accessible.

References

Ellem, B. (2015). Unions, community, work and family in Australia’s iron ore sector. *Labour & Industry*, 25(1), 9-22. doi: 10.1080/10301763.2015.1043511

Ellem, B., & McGrath-Champ, S. (2012). Labor geography and labor history: Insights and outcomes from a decade of cross-disciplinary dialogue. *Labor History*, 53(3), 355-372. doi: 10.1080/0023656X.2012.695213

Herod, A. (2012). Workers as geographical actors. *Labor History*, 53(3), 335-353. doi: 10.1080/0023656X.2012.695212

Greg Patmore (The University of Sydney), **Ray Markey** (Macquarie University) and **Keith Townsend** (Griffith University)

History Repeats? Changes in the Role of Frontline Managers over Time

(i) Summary of the argument

Central to an analysis of the frontline manager (FLM) role in organisations is a persistent question over the FLM's changing responsibilities. A common research theme in literature from various disciplines in recent decades has been the changing nature of the FLM role from an overseer to one with a larger role in administrative responsibilities and more substantial people management duties. Modern scholars in the Human Resource Management (HRM) field refer to a consistent devolution of responsibility from the HR Department to the FLM, exploring which HR activities are being transferred or focusing on a few HR tasks. The issue has also received attention in industrial relations literature. However, we argue that this reading leaves aside a rich history where the FLM (commonly under other names, foreman, supervisor, and so on) has always faced a great deal of responsibility in managing the workforce, albeit in different organisational and economic contexts.

Against the background of this debate the paper aims to understand the fluctuations and shifts over time in the FLM role as a means for understanding the drivers for contemporary change. This paper recognises that FLM can be active agents in shaping their role. It focuses on four factors that may explain the fluctuations in the role of the FLM: management ideas and philosophies, economic cycles, industrial regulation and organized labour. To assess the significance of these four factors the paper reviews the historical literature on the role of the FLM.

(ii) Summary of the findings

Management ideas and philosophies played an important role in explaining and popularising different approaches to FLM, yet these ideas do not begin and end abruptly, they tend to come in waves. The widespread influence of Taylorism and, separately, of ideas relating to employee participation during and immediately after the First World War limited the managerial responsibility and decision-making authority of the FLM, which had previously been relatively unlimited in people management. A significant philosophical shift towards the 'Human Relations' school occurred in response to the harsh edges of Taylorism. Rather than seeking to defeat workplace groups and 'systematic soldiering', the human relations advocates believed that the work group could be co-opted to accept norms and values that suited management's objectives. Management would replace informal and potentially disruptive leadership with FLMs, who would be trained in how to win workers' loyalty. The impact of human relations, for example, can be seen in Australia in the early 1940s when educational authorities introduced training courses for FLMs. Some companies even introduced regular meetings of FLM to improve the standard of supervision. By the 1970s though, the role of the FLM seemed to be reduced to a point where a British Institute of Management report found that the FLM had little authority over

scheduling work, recruiting or promoting workers (BIM 1976). With the advent of more modern 'HRM' approaches to people management, the FLM again appears to be playing a central role within organisations.

Whilst the existing literature does not explicitly address the impact of the economy on the FLM role, it provides evidence to suggest that the role of FLMs has shifted during major shocks to the economic climate. Economic depressions characterised both the late 19th century and the 1930s, when major changes to the FLM role gathered momentum in industry. On the other hand, these shocks may have induced temporary diversions from wider trends. For example, in the US during the 1930s depression a resurgence of the delegated power of the FLM occurred in some industries with workers complaining about the nature of supervision. Alongside this, according to Sanford Jacoby, some US firms curtailed personnel departments leaving FLMs in a stronger position to challenge personnel departments that tried to intervene in daily employment decisions.

Whether through collective bargaining or through industrial regulation in the form of compulsory arbitration, the codification of employment conditions and the creation of grievance procedures placed limitations on the discretion of supervisors and made their decisions subject to review. In the US 85 per cent of collective agreements by 1945 included provisions for grievance arbitration. Management's disciplinary practices became subject to review and they were forced to develop elaborate rules governing worker discipline. As Jacoby, argues this undermined the FLM's freedom to dismiss an employee at will. Conversely, deregulation of centralised wage determination and dispute resolution structures in the past 25 years, notably in the Australian conciliation and arbitration system, has arguably freed up the discretionary space for FLMs in the workplace. The winding back of coverage of workers in terms of awards and workplace agreements also tends to favour a devolution of power to FLMs.

While FLMs were often hostile to unions, during the nineteenth century in Australia there were examples of industries where FLMs promoted unions. In printing, the metal trades and baking foremen remained members of their unions. Indeed, some Australian unions encouraged this, because FLMs could play an important role in maintaining union conditions as well as exercising managerial authority. As FLMs in the metal trades generally hired workers, the Amalgamated Society of Engineers expected its FLM members to hire their unemployed brethren. The growing power of the trade unions in the early twentieth century, however, further weakened the role of the FLM. Shop stewards would commonly undermine the authority of FLMs by dealing directly with more senior managers. The recent decline of trade unionism may have also favoured devolution of power to FLMs.

(iii) Selected references

British Institute of Management (BIM) (1976) *Front-Line Management: Report of BIM Working Party*, Edward Mortimer Ltd., London.

Cascon-Pereira, R, Mireia Valverde and Gerard Ryan (2006) 'Mapping out devolution: An exploration of the realities of devolution', *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 30: 129-51.

Fox, A (1975), *Man Mismanagement*, Hutchinson, London, 1974.

Jacoby, S (1985) *Employing Bureaucracy. Managers, Unions and the Transformation of Work in American Industry 1900-1945*, Columbia University Press, New York.

Kulik, C. and Hugh Bainbridge (2006) 'HR and the line: The distribution of HR activities in Australian organisations', *Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources*, 44: 240-56.

- Lowe, J (1992) 'Locating the Line: The Frontline Supervisor and Human Resource Management' in P Blyton & P Turnbull (eds) *Reassessing Human Resource Management*, Sage, London.
- Marchington, M., Adrian Wilkinson, Peter Ackers and John Goodman (1993) 'The influence of Managerial Relations on Waves of Employee Involvement', *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 31 (4): 553-576.
- Markey, R (1988) *The Making of the Labor Party in New South Wales, 1880-1900*, UNSW Press, Kensington.
- Martins, L-P (2007) 'A holistic framework for the strategic management of first tier managers', *Management Decision*, 45: 616-41.
- Morgan, G (1988) *Riding the Waves of Change: Developing Managerial Competencies for a Turbulent World*. San Francisco, Josey Bass.
- Patmore, G (1991) *Australian Labour History*, Longman Cheshire, Melbourne.
- Patmore, G (2016) *Worker Voice: Employee Representation in the Workplace in Australia, Canada, Germany, the UK and the US 1914-1939*, Liverpool University Press, Liverpool, United Kingdom.
- Townsend, K, (2013) 'To What Extent do Line Managers Play a Role in Modern Industrial Relations?' *Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources*, 51 (4): 421-36.
- Walton, R E (1985) 'From control to commitment in the workplace', *Harvard Business Review*, 2: 77-9.
- Watson, T (1986) *Management, Organisation and Employment Strategy*. London. Routledge.
- Wright, C (1995) *The Management of Labour. A History of Australian Employers*, OUP, Oxford.

Matthew Bailey (Macquarie University)

Formal and informal business knowledge transfer across markets: Developing Australian discount department stores

This paper explores formal and informal knowledge flows to non-competing firms in foreign markets. It draws on examples of Australian retailing firms in the 1960s to consider the ways that firms in peripheral markets gain competitive advantages through the acquisition of expertise and technologies from established enterprises in larger markets. In doing so it provides alternatives to current scholarship on retail internationalisation that tends to focus on the exportation rather than the importation of business models. Further, the role played by informal associations between managers in non-competing firms in different markets during the development of discount department stores in Australia advances the case for socialising analyses of business knowledge transfer more broadly.

Robert Crawford (Monash University)

Re-reading the Office: Workplace Spaces as Historical Documents

More than a mere workplace; the office forms an integral part of an advertising agency's brand identity, illustrating its ability to serve its clients as well as its capacity to produce creative advertisements. By examining the location, layout, and interior design of Australian agencies over the course of the 20th century, this paper will briefly chart the evolution of the agency office. Despite its changes in form, operations, and outlook, the advertising office illustrates that the production of creative advertising would ultimately run second to the business of making a profit.

Julie Zetler (Macquarie University)

Vale Jim Staples: A Great Humanitarian and Social Justice Advocate

Justice Jim Staples, a senior member of the Arbitration Commission, was effectively removed from office by the Hawke Government, and died 'a disillusioned but passionate man,' aged 86 years. His historical contribution to our society as a humanitarian and social justice advocate is his legacy.

Jim was appointed to the Australian Conciliation & Arbitration Commission in 1975 and served on the Commission as a deputy president until 1989, when it was replaced with the Australian Industrial Relations Commission. At the time, Justice Staples was the only judge not transferred to the new body.

Political and legal controversy surrounded this life changing event, particularly in relation to Justice Staple's forced (legislative fiction) retirement remains relevant today. Former High Court judge Michael Kirby, who was appointed to the Commission in 1974, remarked to the media that Justice Staples was 'unfairly treated' by the Hawke Government. Justice Kirby, in a speech delivered in 2000, detailed the controversy surrounding Justice Staples.

It was stated by Justice Kirby that while Staples did not have a background in Industrial Relations Law and that his main ability related to being a criminal advocate for 'unwinnable' cases, from this experience Justice Staples had 'considerable ability in the use of colourful phrases, both in oral and in written expression.' This 'colourful use of language' in his written recommendation was considered by BHP, in a dispute between BHP and the Seamen's Union of Australia, to be 'insulting'. 'This verbal ability was to precipitate difficulties in his relationship with the president and duty presidents of the Arbitration Commission'. A further controversy that lead to Staple's being sidelined stemmed from a wage claim by 'woolstore' workers, in which Justice Staples awarded substantially more than the flat increase expected.

This paper goes beyond the political and legal controversy of Justice Staples' removal from office and pays tribute to his humanitarian legacy and social justice ideals espoused not just in his career but throughout his distinguished life.

Catherine Bishop (Australian Catholic University)

Not Just Pin Money: Businesswomen in Colonial Cities

Contemporary Australian business studies often include gender as a category of analysis. Scholars have discussed the effect of gender on management, small business, and access to capital, as well as female business networks, but these discussions tend to see women in business as a late twentieth-century phenomenon. There have also been individual and group biographies of prominent twentieth and twenty-first-century female entrepreneurs.

However, nineteenth century Australian business appears to be a woman-free zone, with women confined to domestic service or to roles as wives and mothers, in both economic and general historiography. The recent Cambridge Economic History of Australia's chapter on 'Colonial Enterprise' included no women in its analysis of business in nineteenth-century Australia, going so far as to discuss Samuel Terry with no mention of his enterprising spouse Rosetta. Even feminist historiography until recently relegated female businesses to the very few 'short-lived', 'stop-gap', 'pin money' category.

The recent digitisation of archives, notably newspapers, has revolutionised historical enquiry and has allowed new questions to be asked and new findings reached. This paper uses nineteenth-century Sydney as a case study and shows that women were an important part of the city's economy, involved in an estimated twenty percent of businesses in the middle of the century. In spite of social, cultural and legal restrictions, they were running small business and supporting families (including many a hapless husband), earning more than just pin money. In doing this it explores definitions of business, businesswomen, and entrepreneur, refocusing our attention on the importance of small business and on the way in which women helped build the nineteenth-century city.

Day 2 – Friday 4 November 2016

Symposium on Co-operatives, Mutuals and Labour

Nikola Balnave (Macquarie University) and **Greg Patmore** (The University of Sydney)

The Labour Movement and Co-operatives

(i) Summary of the argument

The labour and co-operative movements have similar roots in industrialisation and the idea of collectivism, and share a strong emphasis on member control through democratic practices and ensuring the best for their members and the community. However, co-operatives are also businesses that need to ensure surplus in order to survive and compete in a capitalist economy with businesses that are not organised on co-operative principles. This has the potential to place co-operatives in conflict with organised labour particularly in regard to labour costs and ensuring that recognised wage standards, whether through statutory regulation or collective bargaining, are observed. There may also be a stronger commitment to the organisation by employees given that they are also part owners, particularly in the case of worker co-operatives. This paper will focus on the relationship between the labour movement and consumer and worker co-operatives drawing primarily on the Australian, UK and US experience.

(ii) Summary of the findings

There have been claims made over the years that consumer co-operatives were better employers than their capitalist competitors and enjoyed good relationships with the trade union movement. Co-operatives generally encouraged workers to join unions, with the English Co-operative Wholesale Society (CWS) insisting from 1919 that employees become trade unionists. It was estimated that 94 per cent of the members of the National Union of Distributive and Allied Workers (NUDAW) in the UK in 1931 were co-operative employees. The consumer co-operatives also led the way on industrial issues such as shop employee working hours in the UK. In the USA at Racine, Wisconsin, the 1934 voluntary organising committee for a new co-operative included unionists and union members, who purchased over half the initial shares in the co-operative which began operations as a petrol station on 1 February 1935. The Co-operative had a benefit for the unions in that it was a closed union shop and union wage rates were observed. The Co-operative also provided assistance during industrial disputes through donations of petrol and food.

While the relationship between consumer co-operatives and unions brought advantages for both movements, there were also tensions. In the 1920s there were complaints that unions in the US did not provide reciprocal support by enthusiastically encouraging members to shop at the co-operative. There were concerns in the UK that unions unfairly put pressure on the co-operatives, which were viewed as sympathetic, to leverage increases in wages and conditions from their capitalist retail competitors. The NUDAW claimed in the late 1930s that while the wages and conditions of UK consumer co-operatives were generally superior to the private sector, they were not superior to the standards of the best employers nor were they as much as the co-operative movement could afford to pay. Finally, there have been continued concerns that employees as members would use their voting power at members' meetings to override disciplinary decisions against employees, increase wages and place further competitive pressures on the co-operative. These fears led some consumer co-operatives to place limits on the employees' rights as shareholders by, for example, not allowing

them to stand for election to the management committee or board of directors. Some consumer co-operatives, on the other hand, have allowed for direct employee representation, whereby employees directly elect their own members of the committee or board.

Trade unions have held certain concerns about the operations of consumer co-operatives including the widespread use of voluntary labour, particularly during the start up of co-operatives where there are insufficient funds to pay staff. The Royal Arsenal Co-operative in the UK from its formation in 1868 until 1878 relied upon the voluntary efforts of its management committee to run the store, assisted by a Mrs McLeod, who voluntarily cleaned the store after each day. Her death and the growth of the society led to the appointment of its first full-time member of staff. During the revival of consumer co-operatives in the Bay Area of California in the late 1930s, Pacific Co-operative Services could not initially afford to pay union rates at its depots, with the payments being increased towards parity as business increased. Some contemporary US consumer co-operatives obtain volunteer labour from members by offering discounts on purchases. There are also cases of consumer co-operatives that have limited or no union presence in the workplace such as in rural areas of Australia. These co-operatives have in place extensive welfare provisions and emphasise that workers have a voice in the organisation through their membership of the co-operative.

Trade unions have been generally suspicious of, and even hostile to, worker co-operatives. Organised labour perceives attempts at worker control through co-operatives as legitimating and even strengthening the real control held by capital. Nevertheless during periods of unemployment or in disadvantaged areas, trade unions have seen worker co-operatives as a means of saving jobs. In recent years, for example, the United Steelworkers have encouraged co-operatives in depressed steel towns in the US as a way encouraging employment and stimulating the local economy.

The political relationship between the political wing of the labour movement and co-operatives varies. In the UK the Co-operative Party, which is the political wing of the UK consumer co-operative movement, has had a parliamentary alliance with the British Labour Party since 1927. In contrast, the Australian Labor Party has generally shown little sympathy for co-operatives preferring to focus on legislation and industrial regulation to improve the conditions of workers.

(iii) Selected references

Adams, T., "The Formation of the Co-operative Party Reconsidered", *International Review of Social History*, vol. 32, no. 1, 1987: 48-68.

Balnave, N. and Patmore, G., "Rochdale consumer co-operatives in Australia: Decline and survival", *Business History*, vol.54, no. 6, 2012: 986-1003.

Cornforth, C., "Trade Unions and Producer Co-operatives", *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, vol. 3, no. 1, 1982: 17-30

Hilson, M., "Consumers and Politics: The Cooperative Movement in Plymouth 1890-1920", *Labour History Review*, vol. 67, no. 1, 2002: 7-27.

Markey, R., Balnave, N. and Patmore, G., "Worker Directors and Worker Ownership/Co-operatives", in A. Wilkinson, P. Gollan, M. Marchington and D. Lewin (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Participation in Organizations*, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2010: 237-257.

Wetzel, K.W. and Gallagher, D.G., "A Conceptual Analysis of Labour Relations in Cooperatives", *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, vol. 8, no. 4, 1987: 517-540.

Harry Knowles, Greg Patmore and Mark Westcott (The University of Sydney)

Mutualism and Labourism: Westfund

(i) Summary of the argument

This paper explores the relationship between mutualism and labourism particularly in regard to the health insurance mutual Westfund and Labor's federal health policy. Mutualism is based on the notion of self-help while labourism placed an emphasis on the intervention by the state to redress the inequalities of capitalist society. Mutualism can be informal where workers 'pass the hat around' to assist a fellow worker who has suffered a misfortune such as an accident or illness. Mutualism can assist in more organised forms such as co-operatives and mutuals, with this paper focussing on the latter.

The term mutual is usually applied to a member-owned financial business, whose object is to raise funds to provide services such as savings and loans, life assurance and medical insurance. Like co-operatives they do not require outside investors as the mutuals collect and recycle sufficient funds in the mutual to meet its needs. Mutuals insist that customers become members, while co-operatives in principle can have dealings with customers who are not members. Unlike co-operatives, which are built on principles of democratic governance, with each member having an equal vote, a mutual can have a relatively small number of governing members, who have a recognised expertise in regard to running a health insurance fund and/or community interest, and vote for the board of directors. Unlike Rochdale co-operatives, legislative restrictions also prevent mutuals from issuing dividends, but can provide discounts for members and focus on benefits. Member-owned businesses such as co-operatives and mutuals are contrasted to investor-owned businesses, with the focus of the former being on people and the latter on money.

While member-owned businesses and investor-owned businesses can operate side-by-side, as they do in the Australian health insurance industry, and face similar challenges such as the rising cost of medical services, there are advantages for member-owned businesses. Investors can appropriate profits and increases in share value, whereas members can channel profits into other objectives such as quality of service, community assistance and better conditions for employees. More generally the existence of a member-owned sector provides more choice for consumers who may value the benefits of membership over the goods and services. There are issues for member-owned businesses in raising capital as they rely upon internal sources and they can face similar issues to investor-owned businesses of mismanagement and even fraudulent behaviour by key personnel. There have been significant examples of collapse of member-owned businesses in Australia such as the Newcastle and Suburban Co-operative.

In Australia "labourism" is associated with the Australian Labor Party. Labor Party activists accepted the need to capture the state through parliament. They viewed the state as a neutral arena that could be used to prevent the exploitation of workers and improve their lives. The parliamentary approach of the Labor Party clearly contrasts to the ideas of anarchists and syndicalists who emphasised alternative paths such as mutual aid or revolutionary industrial unionism. While the major thrust of Labor Party thinking as articulated in its national platform has been to favour nationalisation and state intervention, it focused on monopolies or the 'money power' rather than the complete overthrow of the capitalist system. The term "labourism" is a contested one with the term social democracy being used to describe the Party's policies since the Whitlam federal Labour Government. This paper will examine the case study of Westfund, which is a health insurance mutual, to explore the potential for conflict and co-existence between the ideas of mutualism and labourism.

(ii) Summary of the findings

Westfund's origins lie in the steps undertaken by miners in the Lithgow Valley in New South Wales (NSW), Australia to meet hospital expenses through self-help. This tradition of self-help can be traced back to the development of Lithgow as an industrial centre through the development of friendly societies, trade unions and the practice of workers paying their subscriptions to the local hospitals, doctors and the ambulance service. The major impetus for the formation of the Western Districts Health Fund, later Westfund, was the 1953 National Health Act, which became operational on 1 July 1953 and allowed contributors to arrange their own insurance and could choose their own doctors. The patient paid the doctor's fee and obtained a refund from the insurance provider, which received a subsidy from the government. This and subsequent legislation in regard to the Australian medical system have shaped the fortunes of health insurance funds such as Westfund.

There were tensions between labourism and mutualism for Westfund. The miners in the Lithgow Valley were strong supporters of both the Fund and the Australian Labor Party. The Labor Party, however, initially supported the nationalisation of the health industry similar to the UK and under the Whitlam Labor Government shifted to universal health care through Medibank and later Medicare. The role of Westfund under universal health care became problematic as many of its basic services to members could be provided by the State, forcing the Fund to expand its services to include dental clinics. There were also tensions with Labor Governments over whether Westfund could act as an agency for Medibank and later Medicare rather than being in competition. While the Fund did obtain agency status under Medicare, this was lost which placed financial strain on the Fund and provoked conflict with the local Labor federal Member of Parliament.

(iii) Selected references

- Balnave, Nikola and Patmore, Greg, 'Rochdale consumer co-operatives in Australia: Decline and survival', *Business History*, 54, 6, 2012, pp. 986-1003.
- Battin, Tim, 'Keynesianism, Socialism and Labourism, and the Role of Ideas in Labor Ideology', *Labour History*, 66, 1994, pp. 33-44.
- Birchall, Johnston, *People-centred businesses: co-operatives, mutuals and the idea of membership*, New York, Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.
- Birchall, Johnston, "A Member-Owned Business Approach to the Classification of Co-operatives and Mutuals", *Journal of Co-operative Studies*, 44, 2, 2011, pp. 4-15.
- Christison, Ray and Parry, Naomi, *Lithgow Migration. A scoping study outlining journeys to the birthplace of steel making and modern manufacturing in Australia*, High Ground Consulting, Lithgow, 2014.
- Gale, Andrew and Watson, David, *Adventures in Health Risk. A History of Australian Health Insurance*, The Institute of Actuaries of Australia, Melbourne, 2007.
- Macintyre, Stuart, 'The Short History of Social Democracy in Australia', *Thesis Eleven*, 15, 1986: 3-14.
- Patmore, Greg, *Australian Labour History*, Longman Cheshire, Melbourne, 1991.
- Sax, Sidney, *A Strife of Interests. Politics and Policies in Australian Health Services*, George Allen and Unwin, 1984.
- Scotton, Richard, and MacDonald, Christine, *The Making of Medibank*, School of Health Services Management, University of NSW, Kensington, 1993.

Industry superannuation funds: a new kind of mutual

This paper examines how unions established and promoted industry superannuation funds together with representatives of employer associations. At the time of their founding in the 1980s, the superannuation market was dominated by corporate and public sector funds, many of which failed to provide adequate funding, portability or vesting for their members. Less than half the workforce was covered by superannuation, and an even higher proportion of union and blue-collar workers were fully reliant on a state pension that was widely acknowledged as not adequate to provide “dignity in retirement” (Downing 1970). Women, as well as blue-collar workers and casual employees, were largely excluded from a paternalist and “welfarist” model of private superannuation (E.S Knight & Co. 1972, Balnave 2003). Insurance mutuals, which claimed to represent the interests of holders of their policies, were seen by unions as part of the problem in this widespread market failure. When establishing the new funds, union leaders largely eschewed the language associated with the “old” mutuals that had become key pillars of the established financial sector. In framing their appeal to members, industry funds appealed instead to new expressions, such as “all profit to members”. Industry funds also developed a model of 50/50 employer/employee trusteeship or “equal representation” not as an ideological prescription, but as a pragmatic way of dealing with potential opposition to the schemes by employers. The description used by unions in the 1980s was “partnership”. There were no profit-seeking shareholders and all profits were credited to the accounts of the members of the funds (Plowman and Weaven 1989). The trustees and managers of industry superannuation funds contrasted rather than associated themselves with the “old mutuals” which, at the time, were not seen as reflecting the unions’ ideal of political mutualism. It was only with the decline and demutualisation of the three largest old insurance mutuals in the 1990s (Colonial Mutual, National Mutual and the AMP Society) that the industry superannuation funds began to appropriate the language of mutualism, particularly through the efforts of Garry Weaven and the associated institutions of the “industry funds movement”: Industry Funds Services (IFS), Industry Super Australia, Members Equity Bank and IFM Investors (James 1998). This appropriation took place within the context of a perceived need to maintain a collective identity and purpose in the changing marketplace of superannuation.

Mutualism as a philosophy originated as a critique and response to capitalism. Advocated by nineteenth-century socialists such as Robert Owen and Pierre-Joseph Proudhon, mutualism sought to establish a “third way” between liberal market capitalism and state-centred socialism (Giddens 2000, Birchall 2001). Its key principles of self-help and self-reliance among members of a community had made the philosophy of mutualism attractive to the Australian union movement, which embraced the ideals of welfare through work embodied in the protectionist “Australian settlement” (Kelly 1992). The rise of industry superannuation as a “movement” came at a time of close union collaboration with the Australian Labor Party (ALP) through the Australian Council of Trade Unions (ACTU)-ALP Prices and Incomes Accord, as the Hawke and then Keating Labor governments set about a program of economic liberalisation. Industry superannuation was won through bargaining and industrial action in this process, with the funds becoming “alternative organisations” in the sense advocated by Hartmann (2014), although they were not labour-owned firms, credit cooperatives nor insurance mutuals. The narratives of mutualism, however, provide a historical context for industry fund identity. Industry super funds, like many organisations, construct a collective culture and identity through the memory and history shared by their founding figures, many of whom came into superannuation via the union

movement. Narratives of collective action and identity are used to defend the industry funds against threats to their collective or mutualistic ethos, an analysis informed by the historic turn in organisation studies (Rowlinson et al. 2014). The paper contributes to our understanding of the intersections between the ideals of mutualism, the experience of unionism and the continued growth of “workers’ capital”. It argues that while the funds espouse mutualistic principles, they define themselves against the “old” mutuals, in turn trying to create a new kind of mutual.

One of the key concerns in the founding of industry superannuation is the role played by collaboration between the old mutual sector and unions. This collaboration was vital in securing political and institutional support for the funds, in contrast to the opposition of the private market that killed national superannuation reforms in the UK (Pemberton 2010). In its early days, through collaboration between the ACTU, individual unions and the insurance/mutual sector, there was crossover between the two spheres in terms of people and expertise. The development of industry superannuation was heavily influenced by members of the Colonial Mutual subsidiary, Jacques Martin, which won the tenders to be administration provider to Building Unions Superannuation (BUS), the Allied Unions Superannuation Trust (AUST) and other early funds such as the Metal Unions Superannuation Trust/Superannuation Trust of Australia (Jack 1986). Staff from Jacques Martin later came to hold key roles in the industry superannuation movement, Sandy Grant, for example, later becoming general manager of Industry Funds Services and then CEO of Cbus (the fund created by the merger of BUS and AUST). In interview, Grant recalled and contrasted his experience working in a life-insurance mutual to the pioneering development of the industry funds, dismissing the Colonial Mutual of the 1980s as an institution that had lost its earlier commitment to mutualism. Several other industry fund pioneers worried that the new superannuation providers might also one day lose their commitment to being “all profits to members” institutions and go down a similar path of demutualisation. Other personnel moved from the old mutuals into the industry sector from Colonial Mutual, National Mutual and even the AMP Society, taking up key positions in the funds and associated institutions. The industry funds have been outstanding financial successes, but maintaining their identity through narratives and history is a key concern of the older generation of industry superannuation pioneers. Among these narratives, the desire to not only replace but also avoid the mistakes of the old mutuals have been a concern of industry pioneers such as Garry Weaven. This desire also partly informed safeguards to preserve the interests of members in the new funds through the defence of stakeholder and member representation on boards and the promotion of “all profits to members”. The development of industry fund cooperation through bodies such as the Australian Institute of Superannuation Trustees (AIST) and IFS and collaborative campaigns promoting industry funds such as the “Compare the Pair” advertisements may also promote the ongoing defence of this culture through peer solidarity.

The main sources for this paper are unpublished archives and interviews that have been investigated as part of the “Workers Capital” project at RMIT University commissioned and funded by AIST. Archives include those of AIST, the University of Melbourne Archives, the Noel Butlin Archives in Canberra and those of key industry funds. To date, 20 interviews have been conducted with key figures in the establishment and management of the industry superannuation movement.

SELECTED REFERENCES

Balnave, Nikola (2003). *Industrial Welfarism in Australia, 1890-1965*, PhD dissertation, University of Sydney.

Birchall, Johnston (2001). *The New Mutualism in Public Policy*, London: Routledge.

- Downing, Richard I. (1970). 'Portability and preservation of benefits', Superfunds, December 1970, pp. 11-15
- Easson, Mary (2013). 'Present at the Creation: The Origins of the Australian System of Superannuation', MPhil thesis, University of NSW.
- Giddens, Anthony (2000). *The Third Way and Its Critics*, Cambridge: Polity Press
- Hartmann, Rasmus K. (2014). 'Subversive functionalism: For a less canonical critique in critical management studies'. *Human Relations* 67(5): 611-32.
- Holt, Patricia (ed.) (1996). *An Oral History of C+BUS: The Construction and Building Industry's Superannuation Fund*, Melbourne: National Centre for Australian Studies, Monash University.
- Jack, Phillip D. (1986). 'Jacques Martin grabs union business', *Australian Business*, March 12, pp. 34-35.
- James, David (1998), 'Worker superannuation and the evolution of power to the people', *Business Review Weekly*, November 30, pp. 85-86.
- Kelly, Paul (1992). *The End of Certainty*, St Leonards, NSW: Allen & Unwin.
- Kelly, Rosemary (1997). 'Superannuation and the marketization of retirement incomes', *Labour & Industry* 8(1): 57-80.
- E.S. Knight & Co. (1972). *Superannuation Planning in Australia*, Milson's Point, NSW: CCH.
- Pemberton, Hugh (2010). "'What matters is what works": Labour's journey from "national superannuation" to "personal accounts"', *British Politics* 5/1: 41-64.
- Plowman, David, and Weaven, Garry (1989). 'Unions and superannuation', in Bill Ford and David Plowman (eds), *Australian Unions: An Industrial Relations Perspective*, 2nd edn, Melbourne: Macmillan, pp. 251-268.
- Rowlingson, Michael, Andrea Casey, Per Hansen and Albert Mills (2014). 'Narratives and memory in organizations', *Organization* 21(4): 441-446.
- St Anne, Christine (2012). *A Super History: How Australia's 1 Trillion+ Superannuation Industry Was Made*, Melbourne: Major Street Publishing.
- Shaw, Diana (1992). *Trade Union Participation in Public Policy-making: The Rise and Demise of Australia's National Retirement Income Regime*, PhD dissertation, University of New South Wales.

Fiona Hurd (Auckland University of Technology)

Union Mutuality Beyond the 'Mutual': The collective development of a N.Z. Single Industry Town Hospital

This paper discusses the role of unions in mutualism, by exploring the involvement of the combined Kinleith Pulp and Paper unions in the development of health services in the town of Tokoroa, and specifically in the establishment and subsequent development of the town's hospital. As described by Minchin et al (2014), formalised cooperatives and mutuals are defined by a degree of ownership or benefit to members. However, Howieson, Sugden and Walsh (2013) distinguish between these formal structures, and the concept of mutuality embedded in both, namely a sense of shared

ownership and mutual dependence and benefit. This focus demonstrates that mutual and cooperatives can be defined by a commitment to wider stakeholder and community benefit (Michie and Rowley 2014). The collective ideals thus embedded in these formal organisations is not at odds with those of the trade union movement, although tensions exist. However, in considering the wider concept of mutuality, we can see that there may be many ways in which this is incorporated into union strategy, beyond the involvement in formal mutual and cooperative structures. In this paper, the case of union involvement in the development of the Tokoroa hospital is used to explore the ways in which the notion of mutuality may appear in union strategy.

The site of enquiry is Tokoroa, a town in the central North Island of New Zealand, originally developed on company land to support the development of the Kinleith Pulp and Paper Mill which opened in 1954, and the surrounding forestry industry. The town is unique in the New Zealand context, with the initial town development being almost entirely funded by a private company, New Zealand Forest Products, and individual benefactors. In the period 1950-1970, the company also established a range of community facilities and support structures, such as the Fire Station and local housing scheme (Healy, 1982; New Zealand Forest Products 1954), which would usually be established by the local or national governments. However, by 1970, the company was looking to move away from a direct role in the community.

As the Mill and town were established under a period of compulsory union membership in New Zealand, it is perhaps unsurprising that the combined Kinleith unions had a significant role in the workplace, and social structure of the town from establishment (Chapple, 1976). In such towns, the boundaries between workplace and wider community become blurred, and the role of the union becomes wider than simply negotiating conditions of employment.

This research was initiated from participant comments drawn from a larger project focusing on the historical role of New Zealand Forest Products (and subsequent entities) in the town of Tokoroa, a single industry town in the North Island, New Zealand. During the course of this research, a number of ex-union members commented on the involvement of the union in the development of the hospital. One participant noted:

Another thing what the Union did a lot of people here don't know nowadays, just after I started in the bush we had a big Union meeting at Kinleith and they asked us if we would donate £5 a fortnight for six months to help pay for the hospital....a lot of money then and you would have been looking at something like seven, eight hundred workers in the Union and we put £5 a fortnight for six months to pay for that hospital up here.. the government couldn't finance it...

The town's hospital was established as a general hospital in 1970 (Chapple, 1976), after a lengthy period of lobbying on the part of community members. Community demand for services soon outgrew initial hospital capacity, as the town's population, largely attracted to work at the Mill and surrounding forests, continue to boom. The union contributions to the development of the hospital were viewed not as a formal agreement of partial ownership, but rather as an interested party 'fundraising', to provide additional funds, fit-out, and furnishings.

External involvement in the development of state health services is unusual in the New Zealand context, and particularly the case under a Keynesian political agenda (Bedggood, 1974), which was the case at the time of hospital establishment in 1969.

Derickson (1992) tracks the development of the first U.S. Miners hospitals. Derickson describes how the involvement of unions in worker insurance indicated the development of a perspective that unions

were placed to be involved in employee well-being more broadly than simply in the workplace. He also describes how involvement in healthcare was viewed as important to the mining workforce, as the nature of work was hazardous. Parallels can be drawn to the work in the forestry industry, and in heavy industrial processes such as Pulp and Paper processing. The strategic importance of provision of adequate healthcare to a workforce prone to injury can be conceptualised as a driver to mutuality, even through informal contributions. The insights from participants demonstrate the enduring sense of partial ownership over the Tokoroa hospital, illustrating that the ways in which unions may demonstrate mutuality go beyond the formal establishment of mutual and cooperative structures.

This case study is compiled from a range of primary and secondary sources, including regional health board archives, union archives and newspaper articles.

References

- Bedggood, D. (1974). Power and welfare in New Zealand: Notes on the political economy of the welfare state. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Sociology*, 10(2), 104.
- Chapple, D.L. (1976). *Tokoroa: Creating a Community*. Auckland: Longman Paul
- Derickson, A. (1992) From company doctors to union hospitals: The first democratic health-care experiments of the United Mine Workers of America, *Labor History*, 33(3): 325-342
- Healy, B. (1982). *A Hundred Million Trees: The story of N.Z. Forest Products*. Auckland: Hodder & Stoughton
- Howieson, B., Sugden, R., & Walsh, M. (2013). Mutuality in Scottish Healthcare: Leading for Public Good. *Leadership*. 9(2): 162-179
- Michie, J. & Rowley, C. (2014) Mutuality in the Asia Pacific region, *Asia Pacific Business Review*, 20(3): 506-511
- New Zealand Forest Products. (1954). *Kinleith*. Penrose: New Zealand Forest Products
- New Zealand Forest Products. (1981). *The Kinleith Story*. Penrose: New Zealand Forest Products

Christina Ealing-Godbold (State Library of Queensland)

Andrew Spink: Self-Help and Mutual Societies in Early Twentieth Century Brisbane

Self-Help and personal endeavour are at the core of mutual societies. The Labour movement, by contrast, has at its core collective action rather than personal action. These differing core values are reflected in the two separate acts that govern both movements, and also in the divergent paths of each of the movements in Queensland history. Andrew Spink, coachbuilder, union leader, lodge leader and President of the Queensland Friendly Societies Association was active in both movements at different times. A moderate in labour politics, believing in the value of self-help and personal action for the worker Andrew Spink worked tirelessly for the working man, championed education, and personal financial carefulness and saw the role of cooperative societies in providing respectability and proper help for all workers in times of need. Some saw the Friendly Society movement as the self-help component of the union movement Andrew Spink, however, saw the need for both unions and mutual societies if the quality of life for workers was to be improved.

Timothy Kerswell (University of Macau)

The Rise and Fall of Union Cooperative Power in Chhattisgarh

In the Indian mining town of Dalli-Rajhara in Chhattisgarh state, a unique social experiment took place which constituted an important part of both the history of both the trade movement and the cooperative movement in India. Chhattisgarh Mines Shramik Sangh (Chhattisgarh Mines Workers Union or CMSS henceforth) was unique as the first union in India to orient its struggles around the issues of precariously employed contract workers, in this case those who worked in the mines. Prior to the efforts of CMSS, unions in Dalli-Rajhara, including even the Communist Party of India's unions, only organized formal sector workers who were permanent employees of the government owned mines' operator, the Bhilai Steel Plant (BSP).

This paper provides a narrative of the history of CMSS, with a particular focus on the formation of the union, its significant achievements and its later decline. It is the result of lengthy investigation in Dalli-Rajhara undertaken in the summer of 2015 as part of a larger research project in India studying trade union led cooperatives. During this time, I was able to observe the movement at work and interview its top leaders, leading union activists and many of the rank and file workers who were members of CMSS, and leading political figures and rural peasant activists from their political arm, Chhattisgarh Mukti Morcha (CMM henceforth). This group of workers and activists provided an oral history of the movement's work.

This investigation was corroborated by interviews with rival unions in Dalli-Rajhara such as the Communist Party of India run All-India Trade Union Congress and the Communist Party of India (Marxist) run Centre for Indian Trade Unions, both of which have a significant union presence in Dalli-Rajhara. While the movement in question did not publish a significant amount of material, the paper has attempted to those available primary source documents which were made available by the union. Finally, the data is further corroborated through secondary sources which have studied the movement with a different focus in mind.

This paper argues that CMSS was able to build a powerful cooperative movement with an influence well beyond industrial unionism through CMM. The movement's concept was revolutionary in India and marked the first time a trade union went beyond industrial concerns, setting up schools and a hospital, promoting cooperative farming and peasant activism in the countryside, defending slum occupants in the towns and cities and competing in elections. CMSS advocated for 24/7 unionism, the idea that the union should be an important part of the workers' lives at all times, as a model for unions in general, but particularly when organizing contract labourers.

Despite these achievements, the union faced two key tensions which undermined its power base and led to its long term decline. The first was a political struggle which occurred in the fallout of the assassination of the movement's leader, Shankar Guha Niyogi, in 1991. The highly centralized nature of CMSS and CMM were key reasons why they were able to quickly transform the face of Dalli-Rajhara and implement a broad range of strategies. However, this also proved to be a key weakness. Niyogi was clearly the key strategic thinker and ideologue of the movement and his failure to groom a successor meant his assassination was a serious blow. Following his assassination, second tier leaders would vie for power, factionalizing the movement and weakening its legitimacy. There would be a political degeneration in the movement in terms of its methods of activism. There was also significant tension between the union (CMSS) and the political/rural arm of the movement (CMM) which destabilized the movement. An exploration of this tension adds to the discussion about the relationship between social movements and the cooperatives they can form.

Secondly, the union was unable to establish control over the terrain of struggle due to its ideological limitations. The strategy of the union invested union resources into the goal of 'departmentalization' under the auspices of the BSP. This process meant winning permanent jobs for members. The union lost power as the Indian government used a combination of natural attrition of departmentalized unionists and mechanization of the mining process to marginalize union influence from the mines of Dalli-Rajhara. This process was exacerbated by the governmental pressures associated with India's liberalization in the early 1990s. Accordingly, CMSS lost its strength, and the Indian government was able to promote the reestablishment of contract labour in Dalli-Rajhara without the cooperative movement standing in its way.

Moody (p58) has argued that "The vision appropriate to the era of globalization is social-movement unionism" and CMSS certainly represented a social movement union, long before there was theory to conceptualize it as such. However, the CMSS example demonstrates that while social movement unionism is more effective than other forms, it still faces certain challenges as a result of neoliberal globalization. The history of CMSS demonstrates the importance of choosing the right strategy to respond to changing political and economic circumstances as a vital part of building an effective social movement union. Hensman (2010) for example has argued that workers strategies need to be oriented toward the realities of globalization and that examples in India provide examples of how this has been done successfully or otherwise. Whether or not globalization is inevitable can be left aside, however this article will demonstrate that CMSS did not respond adequately to India's liberalization.

The progressive weakening of the unions' position in terms of its political strength and unity, the mechanization and deunionization of the mines, have pushed the union away from its original role as a 24/7 union and toward the role of a servicing union. The union has been forced onto the back foot and is defensively maintaining the position of its dwindling membership. No longer does the union fight its battles in the streets, it has been successfully pacified and reduced to the courts. The history of CMSS and CMM is a case study in the possibilities that cooperative formation presents, but also the contradictions that can emerge as a result from a new and innovative type of unionism.